



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

## GREENE'S "MENAPHON" AND "THE THRACIAN WONDER"

1. In William Warner's *Albion's England*<sup>1</sup> is told the pastoral story of Curan and Argentile. The following is a brief outline:<sup>2</sup> Adelbright, upon his deathbed, intrusted his only child, the princess Argentile, to the guardianship of his brother, Edel. Edel, scheming to make himself sole king of the realm, kept his niece mewed up from all suitors. The fame of her beauty, however, spread over all the world. Curan, "son unto a prince in Danske," disguised himself as a kitchen drudge, and thus secured access to the princess, revealed his noble birth, and declared his love. "Her answer was, she husbandless would stay." The uncle, discovering the secret courtship of the kitchen groom, began to urge the suit, for by such an ignoble match he hoped effectively to dispose of his niece. In order to escape the designs of her uncle, Argentile fled to the fields and took up the quiet life of a shepherdess. "When Curan heard of her escape, the anguish in his heart was more than much, and after her from court he did depart." He settled as a shepherd near the spot where Argentile daily tended her flocks. Soon, by chance, he met the beautiful shepherdess, and "then began a second loue, the worser of the twaene." Argentile yielded to the suit of the importunate shepherd, disclosed her identity, and all ended happily.

2. So far as I can learn, no one has suggested this story as the source of Robert Greene's *Menaphon*. *Albion's England* was printed in 1586, *Menaphon* appeared in 1589; Greene, therefore, was probably familiar with Warner's poem. In his novel he has used the same general plot; this, however, he has modified, expanded, and filled in with details. From England the scene is transferred to the more conventional Arcadia; the uncle is changed

<sup>1</sup> Book IV, chap. xx.

<sup>2</sup> The outline given by Collier (*Poet. Decam.*, Vol. I, pp. 265, 266), and often quoted, is materially incorrect. Curan is not driven from court, nor did the princess love him at all until the second courtship. Moreover, he followed her into the country, and not she him.

to the harsh father; a child is added; the rural background is fully developed; and the closing events are treated in detail. For the plots of his novels Greene needed little more than a suggestion; this, in the case of *Menaphon*, came, I believe, from *Albion's England*.

3. In 1617 the story appeared in a third version by William Webster:

The most pleasant and delightful Historie of Curan, a Prince of Danske, and the fayre Princesse Argentile, Daughter and Heyre to Adel-bright, sometime King of Northumberland. Shewing His first Loue vnto her, his successlesse suits, and the low deiections he underwent for her sake. His second Loue to the same Lady unknowne, taking her for a poore Countrie Damsell. She (by reason of the vnkindnesse of King Edell her vnkle and Gardian) hauing forsooke the Court, and vndertooke the profession of a Neatherdes Mayde. His constant loue (after her long continued unkindnes) rewarded with her wished consent, their happie Nuptials, and mutuall reioycings, his valour and victorious warre with King Edell. And lastly his peacefull installment in the Kingly Throne. Enterlacte with many pritty and pithie prayeses of beauty, and other amorous discourses, pleasing, smooth and delightfull. By William Webster. London. 1617. [4to, 32 leaves; a poem in six-line stanzas.]<sup>1</sup>

This is obviously founded on Warner's *Albion's England*. "It is much expanded," says Collier; "the incidents are related in more detail, and the speeches of the persons given at greater length."<sup>2</sup> The work is inaccessible to me; the title, however, indicates no borrowing whatever from Greene.<sup>3</sup>

4. In 1661 Francis Kirkman printed a play called *The Thracian Wonder*, assigning it on the title-page to John Webster and William Rowley. In his remarks addressed to the reader he gives the following introduction:

It is now the second time of my appearing in print in this nature: I should not have troubled you, but that I believe that you will be as well pleased as myself; I am sure that when I applied myself to buying and

<sup>1</sup> Hazlitt's *Hand-Book*, p. 647.

<sup>2</sup> There is another case of borrowing from Warner's poem, which perhaps deserves notice. "The 11th Ballad in Evans's Collection (Vol. I, edit. 1777) is an impudent plagiarist from Warner, in which generally his very words, with a slight alteration, are used: the names are changed for better concealment."—Collier.

<sup>3</sup> The last reference that I can find to this poem is in the catalogue of Heber's sale (1836). His copy which cost him £15 15s sold for £4 10s. Apparently it is the only copy in existence. It is not in the British Museum or in the Bodleian Library.

reading of books, I was very well satisfied when I could purchase a new play. I have promised you three this term,—*A Cure for a Cuckold* was the first; this the second; and the third, viz. *Gamer Gurton's Needle*, is ready for you . . . I have several manuscripts of this nature, written by worthy authors; and I account it much pity they should now lie dormant, and buried in oblivion.

Writers on the drama are generally agreed that Kirkman was mistaken in attributing the play to Webster and Rowley.<sup>1</sup> Mr. Fleay alone has attempted to identify the real author. He is sure that the play is one of Heywood's lost pieces:

1598, Dec. 6; 1599, Jan. 26. *War without blows and Love without suit* ("without strife" in the second entry). This is the same play as *The Thracian Wonder*; cf. in i. 2, "You never shall again renew your suit;" but the love is given at the end without any suit; and in iii. 2, "Here was a happy war finished without blows." It was probably, like many other of Heywood's plays, revived for the Queen's men c. 1607, when W. Rowley and Webster were writing for them; whence the absurd attribution of the authorship to them by Kirkman.<sup>2</sup>

With remarkable inconsistency Mr. Fleay later in the same work<sup>3</sup> says:

The probable date of production is c. 1617, and the company Prince Charles'. The plot is from *Curan and Argentile*, William Webster's poem, 1617, which was an enlargement of Warner's story in his *Albion's England*, 1586.

It is hard to see how a play performed in 1598, and revived in 1607, could take its plot from a work dating 1617.

In assigning the source of the play to the pastoral poems of Warner and of Webster, Mr. Fleay is following all other writers on the subject.<sup>4</sup> Hence his trouble with dates. The dramatist, however, had in mind, not Warner or Webster, but Greene's

<sup>1</sup> "Kirkman probably knowing the story and that a man of the name of Webster (meaning William Webster) had versified it, thought he might attribute it safely to his name-sake John Webster." Collier, *Poet. Decam.*, Vol. I, pp. 268, 269. Kirkman's professional reputation was perhaps not of the best. On the title page of the first (separate) edition of Beaumont and Fletcher's *Beggar's Bush*, Printed for H. Robinson and Anne Mosely, 1661, appears the following notice conspicuously displayed: "You may speedily expect those other Playes, which Kirkman and his Hawkers have deceived the buyers withall, selling them at treble the value, that this and the rest will be sold for, which are the only originall and corrected copies, as they were first purchased by us at no mean rate, and since printed by us."

<sup>2</sup> *Biographical Chronicle of the English Drama*, Vol. I, p. 287.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.*, Vol. II, p. 332.

<sup>4</sup> See Collier, Dyce, Hazlitt, Sidney Lee, etc.

popular and well-known novel, *Menaphon*.<sup>1</sup> In his introduction to *Menaphon* Mr. Arber says: "It is really in its form a Prose Play enlivened by Songs." The author of *The Thracian Wonder* proves Mr. Arber's statement; he has followed the story as closely as did Shakespeare in dramatizing *Pandosto* or *Rosalind*.<sup>2</sup> The following is a comparison of the dramatis personæ of the two pieces:<sup>3</sup>

"THRACIAN WONDER"

*Pheander*, king of Thrace; later disguised; falls in love with his own daughter.

*Ariadne*, daughter to Pheander; disguised as shepherdess queen.

*King of Sicilia*.

*Radagon*, son to Sicilia; in love with Ariadne; disguised as the shepherd Menalcas.

*Sophos*, uncle to Ariadne; takes side of the lovers.

*Eusanius*, son to Ariadne and Radagon; lost; disguised as shepherd pays court to his mother.

*King of Africa*, who rears Eusanius in his court.

*Lillia Guida*, daughter to Africa, in love with Eusanius.

*Antimon*, shepherd; rescues Ariadne, pays suit to her, and, being rejected, thrusts her from his cote.

*Palemon*, shepherd swain in love with Serena.

"MENAPHON"

*Democles*, king of Arcadia; later disguised; falls in love with his own daughter.

*Sephestia*, daughter to Democles; disguised as shepherdess queen.

*King of Thrace*.

*Maximus*, son to Thrace; in love with Sephestia; disguised as shepherd Melicertus.

*Lamedon*, uncle to Sephestia; takes side of lovers.

*Pleusidippus*, son to Sephestia and Maximus; lost; disguised as shepherd pays court to his mother.

*King of Thrace*, who rears Pleusidippus in his court.

*Olympia*, daughter to Thrace; in love with Pleusidippus.

*Menaphon*, shepherd; rescues Sephestia, pays suit to her, and, being rejected, thrusts her from his cote.

*Doron*, shepherd swain, in love with Carmela.

<sup>1</sup> Mr. Fleay's ingenious identification of *The Thracian Wonder* with Heywood's play is thus, in reality, free from conflict in dates. *Menaphon* was printed in 1589; the entry in Henslowe is dated 1598: "Lent vnto Robarte shawe, the 6 of desembr 1598 to bye a Booeke called ware with owt blowes & love with owt sewte of Thomas hawodes some of iij 11." And again: "Lent vnto Robart shawe the 26 of Janewarye 1598 to paye Thomas hawode in full payment for his booeke called Ware with owt blowes & loue with owt stryfe the some of xxx s."

<sup>2</sup> A careful comparison of the play with Warner's poem shows no borrowing whatever.

<sup>3</sup> I am responsible for both dramatis personæ.

"THRACIAN WONDER"

*Serena*, shepherdess beloved by  
Palemon.

*Clown*, a coarse, foolish shepherd.

*Tityrus*, shepherd who disdains  
love, is overcome by Ariadne.

*Pythia*, priestess at Delphi.

*Two Lords*, ambassadors to Delphi.

*Lords, attendants, soldiers, shep-  
herds, and shepherdesses.*

"MENAPHON"

*Carmela*, shepherdess beloved by  
Doron.

(Probably suggested by the clown-  
ish lovemaking of Doron and  
Carmela.)

(Probably suggested by Mena-  
phon's early disdain of love,  
and later conquest by Sephes-  
tia.)

*Pythia*, priestess at Delphi.

*Two Lords*, ambassadors to Delphi.

*Lords, attendants, soldiers, pirates,  
shepherds, and shepherdesses.*

It would be tedious to trace the similarity of plot throughout. The two works are within reach of everyone. I have collected, however, a number of passages borrowed with little change from *Menaphon*. I do not claim that these are all the passages thus borrowed; a more careful study would probably reveal others. The following, however, are conclusive enough:

I, 2; p. 129:<sup>1</sup>

*Tit.* Yes, prithee mark it;

I'll tell thee my opinion now of love.

Love is a law, a discord of such force,  
That 'twixt our sense and reason makes divorce;  
Love's a desire, that to obtain betime,  
We lose an age of years pluck'd from our prime;  
Love is a thing to which we soon consent,  
As soon refuse, but sooner far repent.

*Menaphon*, pp. 88, 89:<sup>2</sup>

But Gentlemen, since we haue talkte of Loue so long, you shall  
giue me leaue to shewe my opinion of that foolish fancie thus.

What thing is Loue? It is a power diuine  
That raines in vs: or else a wreakefull law  
That doomes our mindes, to beautie to encline. . . .

Loue is a discord, and a strange diuorce  
Betwixt our sense and reason, by whose power,  
As madde with reason, we admit that force. . . .

The numbers refer to Hazlitt's edition of *Webster's Dramatic Works* (1857), Vol. IV.

The numbers refer to Arber's reprint of *Menaphon*.

Loue's a desire, which for to waite a time,  
 Dooth loose an age of yeeres, and so doth passe,  
 As dooth the shadow seuerd from his prime,  
 Seeming as though it were, yet neuer was.  
 Leauing behinde nought but repentant thoughts  
 Of daies ill spent, for that which profits noughts.

I, 2; p. 129:

They're like the winds upon *Lapanthae's* shore,  
 That still are changing: O, then love no more!

*Menaphon*, p. 25:

As vppon the shoares of *Lapanthe* the winds continue neuer  
 one day in one quarter, so the thoughtes of a louer neuer continue  
 scarce a minute in one passion.

I, 2; p. 129:

A woman's love is like that Syrian flower,  
 That buds, and spreads, and withers in an hour.

*Menaphon*, p. 43:

. . . like the hearbes in *Syria*, that flourish in the morne, and  
 fade before night.

I, 2; p. 132:

See where she comes!  
 Like to *Diana* in her summer's weed,  
 Going to sport by *Arethusa's* fount.

*Menaphon*, p. 41:

Like to *Diana* in her Summer weede  
 Girt with a crimson roabe of brightest die,  
 goes faire *Samela*.  
 Whiter than be the flockes that straggling feede,  
 When washt by *Arethusa*, faint they lie.

I, 2; p. 133:

Serena commands *Palemon* not to pay further court to her.  
*Palemon* replies:  
 "Dear love,  
 Recall this doom, and let me undergo  
 Herculean labours."

*Menaphon*, p. 54:

*Samela* commands *Melicertus*: "I charge you . . . not to say  
 any more as touching loue for this time." *Melicertus* replies: "If  
 thou hadst enioyned me as *Iuno* did to *Hercules*, most daungerous  
 labours . . . ."

I, 2; p. 134:

Bar me my food—I'll like the Argive live  
In contemplation of my mistress' beauty.

*Menaphon*, p. 36:

*Menaphon*, like the *Argive* in the Date gardens of *Arabia*,  
liued with the contemplation of his Mistres beautie.

I, 2; p. 134:

Whereas the snickfail grows, and hyacinth;  
The cowslip, primrose, and the violet,  
Shall serve to make thee garlands for thy head.

*Menaphon*, p. 36:

There growes the cintfoyle, and the hyacinth, the cowsloppe, the  
primrose, and the violet, which my flockes shall spare for flowers to  
make thee garlands.

I, 2; p. 134:

I'll fetch Senessa from the down of swans.<sup>1</sup>

*Menaphon*, p. 77:

Or like the downe of Swannes where *Senesse* wonnes.

I, 2; p. 134:

Thou shalt be guarded round with jolly swains,  
Such as was Luna's love on Latmus' hill:  
Thy music shall surpass the Argus-tamer.

*Menaphon*, p. 47:

I should bee garded from the foldes with iollie Swaines, such as  
was *Lunas* Loue on the hills of Latmos; their pipes sounding like  
the melodie of *Mercurie*, when he lulld asleepe *Argus*.

II, 2; p. 145:

In every corner here content sits smiling.

*Menaphon*, p. 33:

In euerie corner of the house Content sitting smiling. . . .

II, 2, p. 145:

The mountain tops I make my morning walks,  
The evening shades my recreation.

*Menaphon*, p. 36:

The mountaine tops shall be thy mornings walke, and the shadie  
valleies thy euenings arbour.

<sup>1</sup> "In common with Mr. Dyce, I am wholly unable to make sense of this line. I think I have seen the name Senessa as the appellation of a certain Druidess."—Hazlitt. *Qy.* Coined by Greene in his Euphuistic manner from *cygne*.



II, 2; p. 145, 146:

I take delight to gaze upon the stars,  
 In which, methinks, I read philosophy;  
 And by the astronomical aspects  
 I search out nature's secrets; the chief means  
 For the preventing my lamb's prejudice.  
 I tell you, sir, I find, in being a shepherd,  
 What many kings want in their royalties.

*Menaphon*, p. 24:

Thou art a shepherd *Menaphon*, who in feeding of thy flockes,  
 findest out natures secrecie, and in preuenting thy lambes preiudice  
 conceiptest the Astronomicall motions of the heauens: holding thy  
 sheep-walkes to yeeld as great Philosophie, as the Ancients discourse  
 in their learned Academies . . . and by being a shepherd findest  
 that which Kings want in their royalties.

II, 3; p. 152 (the following is the oracle in *The Thracian Wonder*):

Content shall keep in town and field,  
 When Neptune from his waves shall yield  
 A Thracian Wonder; and as when  
 It shall be prov'd 'mongst Thracian men,  
 That lambs have lions to their guides,  
 And seas have neither ebbs nor tides;  
 Then shall a shepherd from the plain  
 Restore your health and crown again.

*Menaphon*, p. 22 (the following is the oracle in *Menaphon*):

When *Neptune* riding on the Southerne seas  
 shall from the bosome of his Lemman yeeld  
 Th' *arcadian* wonder,<sup>1</sup> men and Gods to please:  
 Plentie in pride shall march amidst the field,  
 Dead men shall warre, and vnborne babes shall frowne,  
 And with their fawchens hew their foemen downe.  
 When Lambes haue Lions for their surest guide,  
 and Planets rest vpon th' *arcadian* hills:  
 When swelling seas haue neither ebb nor tide,  
 When equall bankes the Ocean margine fills.  
 Then looke *Arcadians* for a happie time,  
 And sweete content within your troubled Clyme.

III, 1; p. 159:

Comets portend at first blaze, but take effect  
 Within the bosom of the destinies;  
 So oracles at Delphos though foretold,  
 Are shap'd and finish'd in your council-house.

<sup>1</sup> This clause, of course, suggested the title of the play.

*Menaphon*, p. 22:

. . . . that Comets did portend at the first blaze, but tooke effect  
in the dated bosome of the destinies; that oracles were foretold at  
the *Delphian* Caue, but were shapte out and finished in the Counsell  
house.

III, 1; p. 159:

And yet I charge you both upon your lives,  
Let not the commons understand so much,  
Lest several censures raise a mutiny.

*Menaphon*, p. 23:

. . . . commanded by proclamation that no man should prie into  
the quiddities of *Apollos* answere, least sundrie censures of his  
diuine secrecie, should trouble *Arcadia* with some sodaine mutinie.

IV, 1; p. 173:

Sitting upon the plain,  
I saw a face of such surpassing beauty,  
That Jove and nature, should they both contend  
To make a shape of their mix'd purity,  
Could not invent a sky-born form so beautiful as she.

*Menaphon*, p. 52:

Not *Ioue* or Nature should they both agree  
To make a woman of the Firmament,  
Of his mixt puritie could not inuent  
A Skie borne form so beautifull as she.

The fact that the author's debt to Greene has passed unnoticed so long calls to mind the passage in Ben Jonson's *Every Man out of his Humour*:<sup>1</sup>

*Fast*. She does observe as pure a phrase, and use as choice figures in her ordinary conferences, as any be in the *Arcadia*.

*Car*. Or rather in *Greenes* works, whence she may steal with more security.

Greene himself complains, in his *Groat's Worth of Wit* (1592), of "those puppets, who speak from our mouths, those anticks garnisht in our colours." It is just possible that he included in his attack the author of *The Thracian Wonder*.

JOSEPH QUINCY ADAMS, JR.

CORNELL UNIVERSITY,  
Ithaca, N. Y.

<sup>1</sup> This play was acted in 1599. Did Jonson have in mind the borrowings in *The Thracian Wonder*? If so, this goes to support Fleay's identification of the play with Heywood's *War without blows and Love without suit*, 1598.